

**MINUTES OF DESIGN EXCELLENCE PANEL MEETING
Thursday the 13th April 2023**

DEP PANEL MEMBERS PRESENT:

Michael Mandl	Chairperson	Mandl Consults Pty Ltd
Garth Paterson	Panel Member	Paterson Design Studio
Sam Crawford	Panel Member	Sam Crawford Architects

APPLICANT REPRESENTATIVES:

Adam Haddow	SJB Architects
Cameron Thomson	Podia
Mark Webster	William Inglis and Sons
Scott Barwick	SJB Planning

OBSERVERS:

Amanda Merchant	Panel Support Officer	Liverpool City Council
Ariz Ashraf	Convenor / Acting Coordinator City Design	Liverpool City Council
Nabil Alaeddine	Principal Planner	Liverpool City Council

ITEM DETAILS:

Item Number: 2

Application Reference Number: DA-1080/2022

Property Address: 155 Governor Macquarie Drive, Warwick Farm NSW 2170

Lot 2 Governor Macquarie Drive, Chipping Norton NSW 2170

Council's Planning Officer: Nabil Alaeddine

Applicant: WILLIAM INGLIS & SON LIMITED

Proposal: The proposal seeks consent for the construction of a ten (10) storey hotel development comprising 73 hotel suites operating 24 hours, basement car park, a centre-based child care facility for 60 children, conference centre, administrative office spaces, and an licensed premises (outdoor terrace bar).

Meeting Venue: Microsoft Teams Meeting

1.0 WELCOME, ATTENDANCE, APOLOGIES AND OPENING

The Chairperson introduced the Panel and Council staff to the Applicant Representatives. Attendees signed the Attendance Registration Sheet.

The Liverpool Design Excellence Panel's (the Panel), comments are to assist Liverpool City Council in its consideration of the Development Application.

The absence of a comment under any of the principles does not necessarily imply that the Panel considers the particular matter has been satisfactorily addressed, as it may be that changes suggested under other principles will generate a desirable change.

All nine design principles must be considered and discussed. Recommendations are to be made for each of the nine principles, unless they do not apply to the project. If repetition of recommendations occur, these may be grouped together but must be acknowledged.

2.0 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Nil

3.0 PRESENTATION

The applicant presented their proposal for DA-1080/2022, 155 Governor Macquarie Drive, Warwick Farm NSW 2170, Lot 2 Governor Macquarie Drive, Chipping Norton NSW 2170

4.0 DEP PANEL RECOMMENDATIONS

The nine design principles were considered by the panel in discussion of the Development Application. These are 1] **Context**, 2] **Built Form + Scale**, 3] **Density**, 4] **Sustainability**, 5] **Landscape**, 6] **Amenity**, 7] **Safety**, 8] **Housing Diversity + Social Interaction**, 9] **Aesthetics**.

The Design Excellence Panel makes the following recommendations in relation to the project:

Previous DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 10 Feb 2022)	Latest DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 13 April 2023)
4.1. Context <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel thanks the applicant for seeking early feedback at the Pre DA stage, and appreciates that the applicant is working with a complex project brief that combines multiple functions such as – serviced apartments, food & beverage areas, a childcare centre, conference rooms, a microbrewery, and an outdoor garden, anticipated to be added to already existing functions such as – the hotel, exhibition space and the stables. Given the scale and 	4.1. Context <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The panel appreciates the design of the garden pavilion (i.e., Site B) and notes that the space will provide ample opportunity for outdoor dining and passive recreation for the hotel guests. The Panel commends the applicant for designing the proposed apartment suites (i.e., Site A) to comply with ADG standards regarding solar amenity / ventilation. The Panel recommends the applicant to

Previous DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 10 Feb 2022)	Latest DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 13 April 2023)
<p><i>complexity of the project, the Panel recommends that the applicant should further develop the project at two different scales –</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>an overall site planning scale, and</i> <i>concurrently at a more detailed scale to show workability for elements such as childcare or hotel operations.</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The panel requests that the applicant show an analysis of different forms for this building that respond to the views, orientation and context of the neighbouring hotel, parkland, Georges River, racetrack and stables surrounding the site that will explain and justify the eventual proposal.</i> <i>In terms of the overall site planning, the Panel expects the applicant to consider a pedestrian + vehicular access and movement strategy, and wayfinding strategy for benefit of each individual function. Furthermore, the site planning should incorporate practical aspects such as – waste collection, loading/unloading (particularly for breweries, food and beverage areas, conference centre and function rooms) and access for emergency vehicles.</i> <i>The Panel supports the provision of larger apartment style hotel accommodation on this site. The panel confirms that only allow 'short-term accommodation on commercial basis', is permitted and that 'residential apartments' or 'residential accommodation' are prohibited uses on the subject site.</i> 	<p>demonstrate other compliances with requirements as per SEPP65 Apartment Design Guide.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel queries the applicant regarding the requirement, feasibility, and nature of the proposed childcare facility. The Panel requires the applicant to establish the current market demand for childcare at this location and demonstrate the level of amenity proposed as part of the facility. The Panel raises concern regarding the proximity of the hotel suites to Governor Macquarie Drive and its presentation to the street (particularly for the ground floor and podium levels). The Panel requires the applicant to review the building / podium elevations / massing and improve the outlook towards Governor Macquarie Drive. Relate the podium massing to the existing low-rise context. The current elevations are underdeveloped The Panel notes that the proposed built form for Site A (i.e., hotel suites) can be supported, however, the new building should integrate with the existing built form of the hotel. Consider appropriate architectural techniques / materiality to better integrate the two buildings together. The Panel notes that the access to hotel suites / childcare might be impacted by traffic volumes during events. The Panel requires the applicant to develop a traffic study during events and race days. The Panel requires the applicant to address the previous recommendations made by the DEP, and prepare a pedestrian & vehicular access and movement strategy, and a wayfinding strategy for each individual function proposed as part of the development. Prepare a response summary for all issues raised as part of both previous and current minutes.

Previous DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 10 Feb 2022)	Latest DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 13 April 2023)
<p>s4.2. Built Form + Scale</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Panel As the project develops further, the Panel expects the applicant to resolve the internal configurations and correlation amongst different functions within the precinct. For example, the drop-off and/or pickup from the childcare centre is co-located with the conference room, hotel lobby and equine sales arena, all these functions appear to be sharing the porte-cochere. • The Panel does not support the building being taller than the existing hotel building. It is the Panel's opinion that the existing hotel should remain the centre piece for the site. • The composition of the façade including podium heights should make reference to the neighbouring hotel. • The Panel notes that a majority of the proposed serviced apartments have either eastern or western orientation and will be exposed to the harsh weather particularly during peak summer. If they are to remain in this orientation appropriate façade treatments for effective sun control and shading should be shown as part of the detailed design. 	<p>4.2. Built Form + Scale</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Panel notes that the proposed childcare facility forms a major component of the ground floor for the hotel. The Panel recommends the applicant revisit the design of the childcare facility and re-organise the play spaces to be more open to the sky and to achieve better solar amenity. • The Panel notes that the access to loading dock is quite constrained and likely to busy. The Panel recommends the applicant to ensure that adequate space for vehicle manoeuvre is provided as part of the detailed design. The childcare centre should be more adequately separated from the loading dock access. • The Panel recommends the applicant to develop the elevations further to better integrate the existing context including the alignment of the podium levels. • The Panel requires the applicant to explore the re-work of the childcare internal layout. The aim is to achieve a better indoor outdoor relationship, more north facing winter sunlit, summer shaded internal and external spaces, with a garden and or adventure play character. • The applicant is to review whether the loading dock ramp can be narrowed to help achieve this. • Other childcare issues relate to the drop off which is shared with the hotel and conference facilities. The safety of the children in the drop off is questioned. • The Panel requires the applicant to review the east-west façades to better respond to summer solar load. Consider shade solutions to improve the overall performance of the building during summer.
4.3. Density	4.3. Density

Previous DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 10 Feb 2022)	Latest DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 13 April 2023)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel supports the density proposed for the site, while the applicant needs to ensure that there are no non-compliance issues in terms of permissibility of use. Refer 1.1 Context – Paragraph 3 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel supports the overall density proposed on site, however, recommends the applicant review the footprint of the hotel, to reduce bulk and to potentially provide more landscaped open space at Governor Macquarie Drive, Porte cochere access road and loading dock ramp precincts.
<p>4.4. Sustainability</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Although the principle of Sustainability was not discussed at the meeting, the Panel expects the applicant to commit to various sustainability initiatives for water, energy and waste efficiency. The Panel encourages provision of ceiling fans within the proposal, as a low energy alternative, and to supplement use of mechanical air conditioning systems. An appropriate photovoltaic system should be considered for power/lighting the common areas. Provision of rainwater storage should be considered to allow reuse within the subject site. Analysis of the solar gain to the east and west facing rooms should be undertaken. If this analysis shows that the apartments will experience high levels of sun exposure in the summer months, appropriate external sun shading will be required as an integrated part of the façade design. 	<p>4.4. Sustainability</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel requires the applicant to consider adequate sustainability measures for the development. Provide a summary of all initiatives being considered as part of the proposal (i.e., water, energy and materiality). The Panel requires the applicant to address the previous recommendations made by the DEP.
<p>4.5. Landscape</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel requires the applicant to develop a detailed landscape strategy for the site and engage an AILA registered landscape architect to develop the landscape scheme for the site. The Panel expects the applicant to maximise the amount of tree canopy cover and vegetation on the subject site and minimise hard surfaces with dark colours. Revised drawings should identify the amount of deep soil areas for environmental benefits. 	<p>4.5. Landscape</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel appreciates the detailed landscape scheme developed for the site. The Panel requires the applicant to consider additional landscaping along the boundary and public domain interface along Governor Macquarie Drive. Provide additional landscaping at ground floor to improve the entrance to the hotel. Provide additional landscape areas and buffers to the childcare facility. The Panel notes that the applicant proposes a large Angophora tree within the

Previous DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 10 Feb 2022)	Latest DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 13 April 2023)
	<p>traffic island near the childcare drop off. The Panel recommends the applicant to consider alternatives to ensure sightlines and visual amenity of the public frontage.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The landscaping, landscape buffer to Macquarie Drive and access roads, deep soil planting at the new hotel appears to be insufficient. It seems like the building is too close to Macquarie drive to provide adequate landscaping. Consider means to improve the landscaping to these areas such as a reduced hotel and podium footprint. • The provision of the new substation along the port cochere drop off road is also unfortunate and will detract from the public realm amenity, and sight lines of the drop off. A better integrated substation is required within the new building or away from the drop off precinct. • The Applicant should review the setbacks of other new developments along Governor Macquarie Drive to provide a consistent treatment. Existing Setbacks should not be reduced.
<p>4.6. Amenity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>The Panel questions the applicant regarding the impacts of solar amenity during peak summer. Develop a detailed solar amenity diagram outlining the impacts on the hotel suites.</i> 	<p>4.6. Amenity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Panel notes that the amenity proposed for the childcare facility is inadequate as its external spaces faces south and east. The Panel recommends the applicant improve the solar amenity for the play spaces within the childcare facility and provide more external environment for these play spaces. • The pedestrian connection between the existing hotel and new hotel needs further refinement / detailing to improve the overall quality of the connection being proposed along the drop-off / public areas. • The Applicant is to demonstrate that the traffic noise and fumes generated along Governor Macquarie Drive will not impact on the children at the Childcare Centre.

Previous DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 10 Feb 2022)	Latest DEP Recommendations (DEP Meeting held on 13 April 2023)
4.7. Safety <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No discussion. 	4.7. Safety <ul style="list-style-type: none"> NIL
4.8. Housing Diversity + Social Interaction <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No discussion 	4.8. Housing Diversity + Social Interaction <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nil
4.9. Aesthetics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel recommends that the aesthetic language should be developed to achieve a more cohesive language for the proposal. The panel found the proposed colours as represented in the renders to be too bold for the context. The Panel expects the applicant to further develop the 3D photomontages whilst incorporating the existing context. A further refinement should be considered for the proposed building materials and textures. 	4.9. Aesthetics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel acknowledges the aesthetics proposed for the building on Site A (i.e., earthy agricultural tones), however, recommends that the applicant consider the materiality / features of the existing hotel building to better integrate the two. The Panel reiterates that there is an obligation to look at the context and achieve a more cohesive design outcome for the site. The Panel recommends that the applicant develop an adequate contextual dialogue between the existing and proposed developments on site. Following the Applicant's comments regarding the colour accuracy of the brick in the existing renders, the applicant is to prepare a revised 3D model / render that depicts the true colours of the bricks proposed. Consider a softer tone of the brick to achieve a better integration. Prepare façade details to demonstrate the detailing of the bricks and other architectural elements for all building façades. The present façade system looks unconvincing.
5.0. Outcome <p>The panel have determined the outcome of the DEP review and have provided final direction to the applicant as follows:</p> <p>The project is not supported by the DEP in its current form and must return to the panel, with all feedback incorporated or addressed.</p>	5.0. Outcome <p>See below.</p>

5.0 OUTCOME

The panel have determined the outcome of the DEP review and have provided final direction to the applicant as follows:

The proposal is not supported by the DEP and must return to the panel, with all feedback incorporated or addressed.